



## Università di Foggia

### FINAL REPORT OF THE ACTIONS AND INDICATORS FOR OPEN, TRANSPARENT AND MERIT BASED RECRUITMENT OF RESEARCHERS (OTM-R) 2018-2020 *Including also previous actions*

Principle	Action	Timing (2018-2020)	Responsible Unit	Indicators	Documentations	OUTPUT 2018-2020
<b>OTM-R SYSTEM (1-10)</b>						
1. Have we published version of our OTM-R policy online (in the national language and in English)?	To publish OTM-R policy on the University website, in Italian and in English	May 2018	Communication Area	Y/N	<a href="#">Link</a>	YES
2. Do we have an internal guide setting out clear OTM-R procedures and practices for all	Publication also in English and updating of regulations to make them more consistent with the specific	Autumn 2019	Service for Recruitment and Management of Academic Staff	Y/N	DR no. 922 14/07/2016 for fixed term researchers updated with	YES

types of positions?	principles identified in the OTM-R, according to the national legislation				<a href="#">D.R. 233/220 prot. NO. 0005302-1/3 12/02/2020</a>  Regulation no. 923 14/07/2016 for associate and full professors updated with <a href="#">D.R. no. 627/221 prot. no. 0022259-I/3 29/04/2021</a>	
3. Is everyone involved in the process sufficiently trained in the area of OTM-R?	To monitor this activity and, as suggested by the EU assessors, to increase training for the areas involved in the OTM-R process	January 2019	Transparency, Anticorruption and Training Area	<b>Y/N</b>  <b>Presence of training programmes for staff involved in the OTM-R process</b>	In past years, according to the provisions of Art. 6, paragraph 13, of Decree-Law No. 78/2010, converted into Law No. 122/2010 (2011 Budget), an annual budget of approximately 16,000 euros was addressed to training activities. Therefore, the Administration was "obliged" to select among the training activities, already approved by the Administrative Board, those that were as close as possible to urgent and unpostponable training needs, due to the spending limits imposed by the regulations in force, activating them according to an alternative priority criterion with respect to the training needs highlighted in the Plans. Starting from 2017, Art. no.1, paragraph 303, letter b) Law no. 232/2016 (2017 Stability Law) eliminated the expenditure limit previously provided for, among others, training activities carried out by	<b>YES</b>

				<p>Universities. Consequently, in 2017, the C.O.A.N. budget, concerning Training, was increased by 5,000 euros which was added to the already established 16,000 euros;</p> <p>In 2018, 2019 and 2020 the C.O.A.N. budget 04.43.18.16 concerning “Staff Training”, was 25,000 euros.</p> <p><b>2017</b> 1 administrative staff attended 3 courses, 1 administrative staff attended 2 courses and 2 administrative staff attended 1 courses for each, for a total of 6 courses;</p> <p>1 English language course at basic level attended by 29 administrative staff; 1 English language course at intermediate level attended by 23 administrative staff;</p> <p>Each course had a duration of 20 hours</p> <p><b>2018</b> English courses: 26 participants; 4 participants; 1 participant;</p> <p>16/10/2018 Training course “Indagine sui</p>	<p><b>40(2018)/56(2017)=0.7</b> <b>108(2019)/40(2018)=2.7</b> <b>6(2020)/108(2019)=0.05</b></p>
--	--	--	--	--	---

					<p>dottorandi e dottori di ricerca” 1 participant;</p> <p>27/11/2018 Training course “Dottorati di ricerca” 3 participants;</p> <p>27/11/2018 Training course “Gestione giuridica del rapporto di lavoro dei professori e ricercatori a tempo indeterminato e dei ricercatori a tempo determinato” 1 participants;</p> <p>2 administrative staff attended 2 courses for each, and 2 administrative staff attended 1 course for each, for a total of 5 courses.</p> <p><b>2019</b> English course: level B1, 27 participants; level A1, 6 participants; level B2, 20 participants;</p> <p>29/01/2019 Training course “La gestione delle risorse umane”, 55 participants</p> <p><b>2020</b> A single A1 level English language course was activated but then suspended due to the Covid-19 pandemic (4 hours, 6 participants).</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--

4. Do we make (sufficient) use of the e-recruitment tools?	Already in place
--	------------------

	<p>E-recruitment tools are already used for applications at all levels: telematic transmission of applications is carried out via pec <a href="mailto:protocollo@cert.unifg.it">protocollo@cert.unifg.it</a>; calls for selection are published on the EURAXESS portal, on the Miur portal <a href="http://bandi.miur.it/">http://bandi.miur.it/</a> (c), on our webpage <a href="https://www.unifg.it/ateneo/concorsi-e-gare/bandi-docenti">https://www.unifg.it/ateneo/concorsi-e-gare/bandi-docenti</a> on G.U. <a href="http://www.gazzettaufficiale.it/30giorni/concorsi;jsessionid=xmLDomG55boOipaqQB8BXg.ntc-as1-guri2a">http://www.gazzettaufficiale.it/30giorni/concorsi;jsessionid=xmLDomG55boOipaqQB8BXg.ntc-as1-guri2a</a> and our Facebook page (<a href="https://www.facebook.com/unifg.it/">https://www.facebook.com/unifg.it/</a>). Selections can also take place via skype-calls and all minutes of the recruitment process are published online.</p>					
<p>5. Do we have a quality control system for OTM-R in place?</p>	<p>Annual qualitative monitoring of the system control for OTM-R through the support of the University bodies such as the Evaluation Committee (“Nucleo di Valutazione” – sezione ricerca) and the Quality Presidium.</p>	<p>31 December 2018,</p>	<p>Evaluation Committee Quality Presidium</p>	<p><b>Ratio between implemented and planned actions</b></p>	<p>The University has set up some bodies to promote and ensure the quality assurance of its processes (University Quality Presidium ), also with regard to the OTM-R. Additionally, the University uses a Unique Guarantee Committee (UGC) for all staff issues. In this regard, it has drawn up, over time, a Code of Conduct [D.R. no. 980/2015 07/08/2015] and the Regulation for the Code of Conduct [D.R. no. 620/2017 25/05/2017]. Uploaded and unified through the D.R. no. 1183/2018 prot. no. 0034724-VII/15 30/10/2018 in Code of Ethics and Code of Conduct. <a href="https://www.unifg.it/ateneo/assicurazione-della-qualita/presidio-di-qualita/riunioni-del-presidio-di-qualita">https://www.unifg.it/ateneo/assicurazione-della-qualita/presidio-di-qualita/riunioni-del-presidio-di-qualita</a> <a href="https://www.unifg.it/sites/default/files/allegatiparagrafo/10-05-2019/verbale_riunione_pqa_12febbraio19_allegato2.pdf">https://www.unifg.it/sites/default/files/allegatiparagrafo/10-05-2019/verbale_riunione_pqa_12febbraio19_allegato2.pdf</a> On 09/05/2019 the</p>	<p><a href="https://www.unifg.it/ateneo/assicurazione-della-qualita/presidio-di-qualita/riunioni-del-presidio-di-qualita">https://www.unifg.it/ateneo/assicurazione-della-qualita/presidio-di-qualita/riunioni-del-presidio-di-qualita</a>  <a href="https://www.unifg.it/sites/default/files/allegatiparagrafo/10-05-2019/verbale_riunione_pqa_12febbraio19_allegato2.pdf">https://www.unifg.it/sites/default/files/allegatiparagrafo/10-05-2019/verbale_riunione_pqa_12febbraio19_allegato2.pdf</a></p>

					Academic Senate established the HRS4R Unit. The related regulation and the appointment of the HRS4R body's members was approved on 12/01/2021 through D.R. no. 62/2021 prot. no. 00001026-1/3. The HRS4R Unit and the HRS4R body are now in charge for carrying out the quality control of the OTM-R process	
6. Does our current OTM-R policy encourage external candidates to apply?	To monitor yearly external candidate applications.	June 2018	Service for Recruitment and Management of Academic Staff	<p><b>Number of applications from external candidates (X year)/ Total number of candidates' applications (X year)</b></p> <p><b>External candidates (X year)/Total candidates (X year)</b></p>	<p>Since 2010, the University has committed itself to publish all types of recruitment announcements on the Euraxess portal (both in Italian and English language) as well as to use simple procedures through e-recruitment tools, as seen before. Therefore, access is open to all, and with such practices, it encourages the participation of candidates outside the organization. However, according to the Italian legislation specific restrictions apply to some types of candidates: fixed term B-type researchers must hold at least a past 3-years contract as fixed term A-type researchers, research grants or scholarships; different qualifications may be</p>	<p>2018: 31/38=0.82 2019: 51/68=0.75 2020: 50/81=0.62</p> <p>2018: 76/105=0.72 2019: 76/123=0.62 2020: 134/176=0.76</p>

					cumulated to reach 3 years); Associate and Full Professors must possess the national scientific qualification (ASN).	
7. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract researchers from abroad?	<p>To monitor yearly external candidate applications.</p> <p>In order to increase participation and recruitment of foreign young researchers, research grants call must be published on the EURAXESS portal also in English language</p>	<p>June 2018</p> <p>January 2019</p>	<p>Service for Recruitment and Management of Academic Staff</p> <p>Higher Education and Advanced Studies Area</p> <p>Doctoral, Scholarship and Research grant Service</p>	<b>Foreign candidates (X year)/Total candidates (X year)</b>	<p>Since 2010, the University has committed itself to publishing all types of recruitment announcements on the Euraxess portal (both in Italian and English language) as well as to use simple procedures through e-recruitment tools, as seen before. Therefore, access is open to all, and with such practices, it encourages the participations of foreign candidates. However, the participation of candidates to fixed-term researcher calls is very limited: this probably because some knowledge of the basic Italian language is necessary to take part in the selection process and, above all, in the subsequent activities (teaching is required in Italian for most Departments).</p>	<p>Year 2018 2/(2+103)=1.9%</p> <p>Year 2019 1/(1+122)=0.8%</p> <p>Year 2020 5/(5+171)=2.8%</p>

<p>8. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract underrepresented groups?</p>	<p>Introduction of a specific article in the calls for selection to inform, as already in place for disabled and DSA students, that non-discrimination is guaranteed in accordance with the Unique Guarantee Committee (CUG) actions.</p>	<p>September 2018</p>	<p>Service for Recruitment and Management of Academic Staff</p>	<p>Y/N</p>	<p>The University is committed to improve its information policies aimed at encouraging the inclusion of people belonging to potentially discriminated groups.</p> <p>The Unique Guarantee Committee (CUG) has already promoted a range</p>	<p>YES</p>
	<p>To monitor the number of underrepresented candidates in selection procedures.</p>			<p><b>Number of potentially discriminated candidates (X year)/Total number of candidates (X year)</b></p>	<p>of activities to implement equality and equal opportunities as well as the prevention and removal of any form of age-related discrimination, disability, sexual orientation, ethnic belonging, to religion and personal convictions.</p> <p>Among the actions, it is worth mentioning “The Memorandum of Understanding” signed by the Office of the Equality Council of the Apulia Region, the University of Salento, the University of Bari, the Territorial Department of Labour of Bari, CGIL, CISL Apulia Basilicata, UIL and the UniFg aimed at promoting, and implementing a “Gender Discrimination Observatory in Labour” in order to put in place specific monitoring, prevention, study, research, training and discrimination measures.</p> <p>The stipulation of the</p>	<p>The indicator is under review as the current one is hardly verifiable since it requires sensitive data that could lead to potential discrimination.</p>



					<p>aforementioned Memorandum was approved in the Academic Senate on 18/112015.</p> <p>Furthermore, the service for students with disabilities and difficulty in learning ability, is active at the University (<a href="https://www.unifg.it/disabilita-e-dsa">https://www.unifg.it/disabilita-e-dsa</a>) as well as a “service card” and a specific committee which supports activities for teaching organization and integration of this kind of students.</p> <p>All calls for researchers recruitment contain the following information: “The University guarantees equal opportunities for men and women as regards access to employment and treatment at work”.</p> <p>In addition, in order to guarantee the right of disabled people to take part in examinations, the calls contain the following information: “In application form, disabled candidates must specify whether they need additional help or time for the interview in relation to their disability”.</p>	
--	--	--	--	--	--	--

9. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to provide attractive working conditions for researchers?	<p>To publish on the University's website all the information related to the tax conditions for researchers in their dedicated section, for maximum transparency. In addition, always on the website, a link could be added with uploading tables reporting the economic treatments expected for the newly recruited</p> <p>Publication on the University website of all information related to the "fiscal" conditions of researchers, for the maximum transparency. In addition, publication on the University website of tables showing the economic treatments envisaged for new recruited researchers.</p>	June 2018	<p>Service for Recruitment and Management of Academic Staff</p> <p>Quality Presidium</p>	Y/N	<p><a href="#">Link</a></p> <p>On October 2017, the University conducted a monitoring activity aimed at assessing structures in support of research, teaching and administrative/accounting management by administering a questionnaire to staff.</p> <p>The General Direction aimed at detecting any criticalities in the structures under evaluation.</p> <p>This is also linked to a testing phase of the new organizational model.</p> <p>In addition, the Quality Presidium and the Permanent Learning Centre, in accordance with the Academic Senate Resolution 03/11/2016 organized a Training Course for teaching of the newly recruited researchers (A and/or B types) or</p>	<p>YES</p> <p>In a.y. 2018/2019 2019/2020, evaluation questionnaires were administered only to students</p>	
	To monitor the satisfaction level of researchers on services provided by University					<p>Percentage of positive responses to questionnaires</p>	<p>In a.y. 2018/2019 2019/2020, evaluation questionnaires were administered only to students</p>
	Teaching courses for the new recruited or upgraded researchers					<p>Number of participating recruited researchers (X+1 year)/Number of participating recruited researchers (X year)</p> <p>Number of participating researchers with an upgraded position (X+1 year)/Number of participating researchers with an upgraded position (X year)</p>	<p>Fixed term researchers (A and B type) 10(2018)/5(2017)=2 7 (2019)/10 (2018)=0.7</p> <p>Researchers with an upgraded position 14(2018)/4(2017)=3.5 13 (2019)/14(2018)=0.9</p> <p>No data available for 2020</p>

					professors who have upgraded their position. The aim was to provide an overview of the most important teaching and sociological issues concerning the professionalism of the university professors, with particular attention to A.V.A.	
10. Do we have means to monitor whether the most suitable researchers apply?	Along with the Quality Presidium and the Evaluation Committee, some points might be extended to provide also facsimile for highlighting what the candidates' skills are, by modifying Regulation n. 923 and n. 922 14/07/2016	June 2019	Service for Recruitment and Management of Academic Staff  Higher Education and Advanced Studies Area  Doctoral, Scholarship and Research grant Service  Evaluation Committees and Quality Presidium	Y/N	The University is committed to provide the recruitment committees with a form for monitoring the all candidates requirements. Indeed, the qualification assessment is facilitated by the University guidelines (facsimile of the minutes)	YES
<b>ADVERTISING AND APPLICATION PHASE (11-15)</b>						
11. Do we have clear guidelines or templates (e.g. EURAXESS) for advertising positions?	Already in place since March 2010					
12. Do we include in the job advertisement references/links to all the elements foreseen in the relevant section of the toolkit? [section 4.4.1 a – Advertising and application phase del Toolkit*]	To create a link on the website for the OTM-R toolkit to monitor that all requested elements are guaranteed and present in the calls (i.e. institutional referent for the OTM-R policy; an institutional referent for gender balance policy)	March 2019	Service for Recruitment and Management of Academic Staff	<b>Number of access to the link (X+1 year)/Number of access to the link (X year)</b>	In the recruitment calls, the University has already set out some elements of the Toolkit provided by the European Commission's Report, such as working conditions; workplace; entitlements (salary, other benefits, etc.)	<b>The indicator is under review as the current one is hardly verifiable</b>

13. Do we make full use of EURAXESS to ensure our research vacancies reach a wider audience?	Already in place since March 2010					
14. Do we make use of the other job advertising tools?	<p style="text-align: center;">Already in place</p> <p style="text-align: center;">The University uses several communication media, including social media, to disseminate the calls for proposals as widely as possible (MIUR portal; University website; Italian Official Gazette; Facebook <a href="https://www.facebook.com/unifg.it/">https://www.facebook.com/unifg.it/</a>)</p>					
15. Do we keep the administrative burden to a minimum for the candidate? [section 4.4.1b]	<p style="text-align: center;">Already in place</p> <p style="text-align: center;">The use of self-certifications in the presentation of titles and documents minimizes the administrative burden.</p>					
<b>SELECTION AND EVALUATION PHASE (16-19)</b>						
16. Do we have a clear rules governing the appointment of selection committees? [section 4.4.2 a del Toolkit*]	To add a link in the call to inform about the recruitment regulations no. 922 and no. 923 14/07/2016	September 2018	<p style="text-align: center;">Service for Recruitment and Management of Academic Staff</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Higher Education and Advanced Studies Area</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Research Service and Project Management</p>	<b>Number of access to the link (X+1 year)/Number of access to the link (X year)</b>	The University regulations contain the rules for the appointment and composition of the recruitment Commissions.	<p>Regulation concerning the recruitment of associate and full professors: 2018: 121 2019: 166 2020: 273</p> <p>Procedures for comparative selections and the appointment of full and associate professors and researchers, as well as transfer and mobility 2018: 5 2019: 17 2020: 34</p> <p>Regulations for teaching staff 2018: 708 2019: 962 2020: 1,103</p>

17. Do we have clear rules concerning the composition of selection committees?	Already in place and defined at national level					
18. Are the committees sufficiently gender-balanced?	To include, in the two articles of the Regulations relating to the recruitment of new teaching staff, some guarantee for gender equality, consistent with gender diversity	September 2020	Service for Recruitment and Management of Academic Staff	Statistics on the composition of committees	<p>National legislation for the public employment requires that in the recruitment committees the less represented gender cannot be lower than 30% [Article 57 (1) (a) and paragraph 1-bis, Legislative Decree 165/2001 and subsequent amendments].</p> <p>In Regulation no. 923 art. 5, paragraph 2, in Regulation no. 922, art. 7, paragraph 1, and specifically in Regulation no. 923, art. 4, paragraph 3, the presence of components of different gender is normally provided in the committees.</p> <p>In fact, the UniFg recruitment committees, were formed as follows:</p> <p>2015 74% males 26% females</p> <p>2016: 78% males 22% females</p> <p>2017: 76% males 24% females.</p>	<p><b>2018</b> 34.26 % females, 65.74 % males</p> <p><b>2019</b> 28.43 % females, 71.57 % males</p> <p><b>2020</b> 26.19 % females, 73.81 % males</p>
19. Do we have clear guidelines for selection committees which help to judge 'merit' in a way that leads to the best candidate	As outlined in point 10, these guidelines will be produced in synergy with the Evaluation Committee and the Quality	July 2020	Service for Recruitment and Management of Academic Staff	Y/N	We do not have clear guidelines for selection committees.	NO

being selected?	Presidium.					
<b>APPOINTMENT PHASE (20-22)</b>						
20. Do we inform all applicants at the end of the selection process?	Done according to the national procedures					
21. Do we provide adequate feedback to interviewees?	To provide a short deadline in the call for such feedback	September 2018	Service for Recruitment and Management of Academic Staff  Higher Education and Advanced Studies Area  Quality Presidium	Y/N	The recruitment office posts all minutes related to the selection procedures on the university website.  The minutes contain precise references to the criteria and evaluation methods and to the results achieved by each candidate.  All candidates can access them.  The assessment is sent to all applicants admitted to the last stage of the section process with no need of submitting any formal request.	YES  Assessments are notified in 7 days.
	To elaborate a questionnaire to assess the satisfaction level.					<b>Number of respondents to the assessment questionnaire</b>  <b>Percentage of positive answers</b>  No questionnaire was administered to assess the satisfaction degree.  To nominate a working group to develop evaluation questionnaires for each phase of OTM-R
22. Do we have an appropriate complaints mechanism in place?	To elaborate a statistical report about complaints indicated in the register of accesses (update every 6 months)	February 2019	Transparency, Anticorruption and Training Area	Statistics on complaints for year	At the basis of every possible complaint there is the right - for every citizens, companies and associations - to access an administrative document and to obtain a copy according to Law 241/1990, regulated by the D.P.R. 352/1992 and modified by laws 11/02/2005 no.15 and 14/05/2005 no.80.  Legislative Decree no.	<b>2018</b> no. 57 requests for access  <b>2019</b> no. 224 requests for access  <b>2020</b> no. 102 requests for access

					<p>33/2013 provides the institution of civic access that includes the right of anyone to request documents, data and information from public administrations. The request can be submitted by anyone who has a direct, concrete and current interest. The request for access, if related to data and documents held by the Public Administration, must be presented alternatively:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• to the Office that holds the data, information or documents (Person in charge of the single procedure)</li> <li>• public relations office</li> <li>• to the Head of Prevention of Corruption and Transparency.</li> </ul> <p>In cases of total or partial denial of access or nonresponse, the applicant may submit a review request to the Head of Prevention of Corruption and Transparency.</p> <p>The University has issued the Regulation governing the administrative procedures, the right of access to administrative documents and civic access.</p> <p>Following Resolution no.1309/2016 of ANAC</p>	
--	--	--	--	--	--	--

					(National Anti-Corruption Authority) “Guidelines containing operational indications for the definition of exclusions and limits to civic access as per art. 5 comma 2 of the legislative decree 33/2013”, the so-called “Register of accesses” has been created which indicates, among other things, any complaints submitted.	
<b>OVERALL ASSESSMENT (23)</b>						
23. Do we have a system in place to assess whether OTM-R delivers on its objectives?	<p>To monitor the OTM-R process delivers on its objective with the University Presidium of Quality in synergy with the Evaluation Committee. Together with the HRS4R working group, specific activities will be decided. To implement and update the assessment system.</p> <p>To monitor the OTM_R system with the Quality Presidium and the Evaluation Committee. Together with the HRS4R working group, specific activities will be decided To implement and update the system</p>	September 2019	Evaluation Committees and Quality Presidium	Y/N	<p>The last monitoring has been carried out in February 2019 by the Quality Presidium.</p> <p><a href="#">LINK</a> On 09/05/2019 the Academic Senate established the HRS4R Unit. The related regulation and the appointment of the HRS4R body’s members was approved on 12/01/2021 through D.R. no. 62/2021 prot. no. 00001026-1/3.</p> <p>The HRS4R Unit and the HRS4R body are now in charge for carrying out the quality control of the OTM-R process</p>	<b>YES</b>



a) Advertising the post

In line with the principles "Recruitment" and "Transparency" of the Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers, it is recommended to keep the job advertisement and description of requirements as concise as possible and include links to more detailed information online. Applicants should be able to find information on:

- organisation and recruiting unit
- job title, specifications and starting date
- researcher career profiles (R1-R4) with the respective 'required' and 'desirable' competencies
- selection criteria (and possibly their respective 'weight'), including knowledge and professional experience (distinguishing the 'required' and 'desirable')
- number of available positions • working conditions, workplace, entitlements (salary, other benefits, etc.), type of contract
- professional development opportunities • career development prospects It should also include:
- the application procedure and deadline, which should, as a general rule, be at least two months from the publication date and take account of holiday periods
- a reference to the institution's OTM-R policy
- a reference to the institution's equal opportunities policy (e.g., positive discrimination, dual careers, etc.)
- contact details

b) Keeping the administrative burden to a minimum

The request for supporting documents should be strictly limited to those which are really needed in order to make a fair, transparent and merit-based selection of the applicants. Moreover, in cases where certain documents are legally required, applicants should be allowed to make a declaration in which they engage to provide the proof after the selection process is concluded. For example, applicants should not have to provide original or translated certificates related to qualifications with their initial application. It is strongly recommended to allow the transmission of supporting documents by electronic means and possibly to develop an e-recruitment tool.